

Arlington Historic District Commissions

October 23, 2014
Whittemore Robbins House

Final & Approved Minutes

**Commissioners
Present:**

**M. Bush, B. Cohen, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka,
J. Nyberg, M. Penzenik, J. Worden**

**Commissioners
Not Present:**

D. Baldwin, C. Barry, J. Cummings, M. Logan

Guests:

**T. Makowka, A. McAfee, A. Deck, J. Schiller, K. Walrath, M. Noonan,
D. Klosterman, S. Deck**

1. **AHDC Meeting Opens** 8:00pm
2. **Appointment of alternate Commissioners – B. Cohen and J. Nyberg will not vote on 202 Pleasant Street.**
3. **Approval of draft minutes from September 18, 2014 – S. Makowka moved discussion; - pg 2 second paragraph, 4th last line correction – s/b S. Makowka not S. Worden. B. Cohen made motion to approve with correction, seconded by M. Bush. Unanimous approval.**
4. **Communications**
 - a. **Email re: CONA application for Parmenter School (17 Irving St) addition of deck**
 - b. **Email re: CONA Application for 16 Montague Street (Zona) re: addition of deck**
 - c. **Email re: Pleasant Street Church of Christ renovation question from neighbor**
 - d. **CONA Application for 244 Pleasant St. (Pressman) for repairs to stairs, railing, decks**
 - e. **Letter re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh) requesting roofline be kept as approved**
 - f. **Letter e: 23 Jason Street (Hammerman) requesting front steps be kept as shown in historic photos**
 - g. **Email re: 174 Westminster (Szaraz) re: basement window changes**
 - h. **Resumes for interested open Commissioner Seat**
 - i. **Emails re: front door change on Westminster**
 - j. **Congregational Church emails**
 - k. **Meeting attended by members of local Boy Scout Troop 306 who are working on their communications merit badge.**
5. **New Business**

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm

 1. **Formal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh) re: revisions on previously approved plans – applicant communicated that they will be in next month with new application.**
 2. **Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 202 Pleasant Street (Noonan) re: addition of dormer on rear of house. S. Makowka gave recap on project – subject structure was**

originally a carriage house and the owner wants to renovate and create more livable space on the top floor. Applicant suggested a shed dormer but the Commissioners was concerned with the option presented – thought it looked incongruous and the drawing elements didn't seem to fit the period or the architectural style of house. Also, the applicant asked about reconfiguring other doors and windows as well as dormer and was advised that we need to see drawings of proposal.

Mr. Noonan said two things going on sometimes compete with each other – 200 year old carriage house on Pleasant Street which hasn't changed a lot over the years but the house needs to be renovated to rehabilitate the inside and make it usable. His primary purpose of coming to the Commission is to alter back roof and put in dormer to provide windows that will overlook Spy Pond and will allow floor to utilize more of space than is currently possible due to shallow slope of roof. An additional point is that the front of house doesn't look good, so they want to modify some of the window's size and location. Windows modified and moved slightly – dotted ones shown on the plans are where existing windows are and solid are where they would like them to be moved. Mr. Noonan indicated that he appreciated the insights of M. Penzenik who visited the site and discussed some possible solutions. The existing windows are very randomly placed. M. Penzenik said they are attempting to bring in more light and also meet fire codes for size of windows.

Mr. Noonan said they are doing a lot of work designing inside and are looking at various alternatives. A shed dormer is their proposed approach because it utilizes space as effectively as it can and they have made other alterations to satisfy Commissioner requests: the sides of dormer pulled in from edge of house and the roof detail is redrawn. Also, they are proposing to move windows on 2nd floor and slightly on 1st floor of the rear facade. He also showed a gabled version alternative as well as a "cat's ear" alternative, and finally an offset smaller shed which is a functional alternative, not 1st choice but 2nd choice due to loss of usable floor space. He also stated that they propose to shift in the internal level of the floors level to equalize the height on the first 2 floors.

S. Makowka said he appreciates the applicant's work on presenting numerous options. He does not like the cat's ear dormers and feels that the flat gable doesn't work. Discussion about usable space. J. Worden asked about wide gable (option 2) and curious why you did it so wide but not a lot of usable space created – B. Cohen disagreed because roof pitch gives very little head height. Essentially filling in 3rd floor. M. Penzenik said spirit of house is crying out for new life and to be able to let it have new life is an opportunity we don't want to miss. J. Nyberg said shed dormer (option 1) is a nice simple addition to the building. Simplicity of lines is nice, clean views. M. Bush said the window changes throughout make him happier. S. Makowka asked if it makes sense for the windows to be more balanced – Mr. Noonan said it makes a difference inside. Discussion about window locations. The Commission advised that windows should line up. Mr. Noonan indicated that the proposed new windows will be the same ones that were approved on Lot 47. S. Makowka specified that they must meet the guidelines for new windows – they must be all wood non-clad windows consistent with Commission guidelines, with permanently applied muntins with spacers to simulate divided light. Mr. Noonan also confirmed that all siding and trim will be real wood, and that he would like to use the fiberglass gutters suggested by the Commission as an alternative. S. Makowka asked about the windows on plan sheet A7, a side that is visible from Pleasant St. at an angle. Mr. Noonan stated that you are looking at the location of new stairs proposed on interior. Go to Page 01 you will see new stairs 01-to 02-to 03. The "ghost" windows are just the stairs location. The

Commission suggested instead of removing 3 windows – to add window in gable and / or in the stairs for light. Move the new windows shown on that side in away from the edge and maybe add something in the stairs for light. Last issue is putting in a window to give a little architectural interest in the gable. Gable on A7 is blank and historically that would not have happened – so the preference is to have a window there even if it is a false window. A4 – C. Hamilton asked about smaller window and she feels all windows on front should be same size if possible. M. Penzenik said given what it is now and what it will look like, she feels it is ok. Discussion about possible chimney removal. Window needed on plan sheet A05 façade to balance the kitchen. The front door is moving, but new door should be as plain as possible, appropriate to style and approved by monitor prior to installation. Door should be specified as all wood not faux wood, jalousie, steel, etc. but maybe with appropriate lites. Mr. Noonan said he will work with the monitor for approvals to get this going tonight. M. Bush moved approval of plans submitted with following changes: in particular on elevation A4, the new front door shall be all wood, no cladding, if no light it shall be appropriate to period as determined by monitor; on sheet A5, the second floor window in kitchen is shown as being there but is proposed to be eliminated – we require that a window is to be seen in that location, above counter height is acceptable, with final location to be determined by monitor; changes shown on plan unless otherwise specified; on elevation A6 windows on 1st floor be moved out to align better with windows on 2nd and 3rd; window on 2nd floor left be a single window not a pair as shown and all four of windows align vertically, details to be determined by monitor; shed dormer as shown on A6 variation #1 accepted; on sheet A7 recommend windows in stairwell next to chimney on first and 2nd floor stair landings windows as shown on right side of elevation should be moved in slightly and a window centered on 3rd floor in gable end (could be false if interior demands); and leave to discretion of monitor determination of chimney removal option, but not required. J. Nyberg seconded for discussion. Suggested that motion be amended to specify that all materials be consistent with design guidelines, e.g., wood trim, fiberglass gutters. Amendment adopted by M. Bush. Plans to be updated, provided to monitor and approved prior to doing any work on the outside. Amended motion seconded by M. Penzenik. Unanimous approval. J. Nyberg and B. Cohen not voting. M. Penzenik appointed monitor.

3. **Formal Hearing re: 94 Pleasant Street (Kaplan Annette Trustee, Pleasant St Realty) re: window replacements.** Applicant B. Kaplan wants approval to replace windows on entire building at 94 Pleasant Street. Applicant's contractor went to building department and they said to there was no issue except for wind ratings. There was, and still is, no permit issued for this replacement. Contractor purchased vinyl replacements. The applicant stated that there are a mixture of older original wood windows and some metal casement windows installed in cinderblock additions that were covered in vinyl siding before the District was created. The Commission asked the applicant to look at options and give us some options. The Applicant described that in early 60s, a cement block addition was built on the right side, front and left side of property. This added a single story addition running down Wellington street about 60 feet. The exterior façade is 70% cement block with bits of the original house peeking out on second and third floor. Applicant put vinyl siding on concrete to make it more uniform with the original piece of the house which had some type of siding. He feels that this made property more aesthetically appealing. Over the years he has renovated and restored the inside of property and has re-landscaped the outside. Applicant now wants to complete renovations by replacing the windows.

B. Cohen said there are examples of other properties that had cement block additions that were removed or better incorporated. J. Worden said there is a precedent

problem – our guidelines say vinyl windows are not allowed. Do we send message that it is better to ask forgiveness than permission. Applicant stated that in terms of setting a precedent there is no other buildings that are $\frac{3}{4}$ cement block. He is only looking to cover existing building and improve it. B. Cohen said there is a lot of original house left -- the body of the house is still there and this is a really good opportunity to actually help bring this building back to its splendor. There are a number of buildings where they had the cinderblock covered appropriately with a lot of thought to make the house closer to what it was at one time. S. Makowka said one goal of Commission is to do no more harm and hope that someone in the future will restore the structure. M. Penzenik said that vinyl windows can be spotted immediately. It seems that problem is that you and your contractor acted on something you were told by someone at the building dept. and now you are arguing that because the building is vinyl we should give up and allow vinyl windows. S. Makowka stated that he is open trying to help find a solution, but cannot see putting in vinyl windows throughout the house just because you argue the building has vinyl siding. M. Bush would be willing to “horse-trade” to get somewhere. J. Worden argued that you are in a historic district and you should have known that you would not be allowed vinyl windows.

The applicant stated that he is trying to make the place look better and believes that wood windows would detract from the vinyl siding. He stated that wood frame windows on upper floors might be what they have to do to please the Commission but he feels it's not going to look alright with the other windows. M. Bush asked if anyone would approve vinyl windows on the property in any way, shape or form. S. Makowka said if there were some type of proposal in front of him he might be open to hearing. He highlighted the problem that the Applicant has not provided an inventory of the proposed changes and has not provided any information such as pictures of existing overall conditions that would allow for discussion of alternatives. The Applicant apologized that his contractor was not at the meeting to provide that information. B. Cohen said she walks past the building every day and the more she thought about it she believes this is a good opportunity to improve the house. It is ugly now and you could make it nicer. Applicant will continue until next month and come in with proposals to help mitigate the situation.

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtors
- c. Discussion re: AHDC District Maps
- d. At-Large Commissioner Vacancies – D. Klostermoon spoke to Commission. M. Audin, Stewart Lipp expressed interest
- e. Discussion re: Town Procedures for Significant Properties List

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

75 Pleasant Street (Boston Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations): S. Makowka and B. Cohen went to former Congregational Church to meet with architect. Issues discussed include: the transformer location requires non-

combustible material due to fire code. They put up Hardee Plank on rear addition but will change to match shiplap in concrete product. Complication is that they state a need to remove the original fabric on the back of the church in that location. Applicant was encouraged to move the transformer and preserve the original fabric of the church. On eaves, wrong detail on front and rear of the gable where it comes down to the corner; they stopped the crown molding a foot short of the end of the gables and had a flat gable sticking out in space. The architect understands that it is wrong and is going to propose a change that takes the crown molding down and bring it down to finish the gutters. Finally, the plans specify wood windows and trim around windows but if you look closely on the corner board detail it is specified as Azek. They trimmed the windows and the corner boards in an artificial composite material with the grain side out. It is painted but looks wrong. It was asked if the grain could be sanded down but not likely possible. Monitors will pursue issues and perhaps ask that the front to be all wood, corner boards to be all wood. We need to figure out how to protect our interests on projects to be sure nothing “fake” slips through the cracks of the application process.

1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O’Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
11. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
12. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
13. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
14. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
15. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
16. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 12-14P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
17. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) Penzenik - COA (House Redesign)
18. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
19. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
20. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
21. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
22. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) Cohen – COA (House Addition)
23. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
24. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
25. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
26. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)
27. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
28. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
29. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
30. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
31. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
32. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
33. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)
34. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
35. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)

36. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
37. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka –COA (solar panels)
38. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)
39. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
40. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
41. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
42. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
43. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
44. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
45. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
46. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
47. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
48. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
49. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
50. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
51. 24 Central Street (Donnelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
52. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
53. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
54. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
55. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
56. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
57. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)
58. 135 Pleasant St. Unit 9&10 (Atkinson-Bing – 13-73P) – Makowka – COA (a/c condenser and rear porch door)
59. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)
60. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-77P) – Barry – COA (skylight)
61. 11 Russell Terrace (Boroway – 14-01R) – Makowka – CONA (basement windows/siding)
62. Lot 47 (aka 247) Pleasant Street (Alouette Rlty/Noonan – 14-02P) – COA (New Building)
63. 111 Pleasant St. (Fredieu – 14-03P) – COA (Awnings)
64. 40 Westmoreland Ave. (Radoslovich – 14-04M) – CONA (Rear & deck sliders)
65. 17 Russell St. (Makowka –14-05R) – 10 Day COA (roof & gutters)
66. 21 Oak Knoll (Donal – 14-06P) – CONA (side door)
67. 59 Jason Street(Bouvier – 14-07J) – CONA (fence)
68. 187 Lowell Street (Grinnell – 14-08M) – CONA (Gutters, chimney, roof)
69. 195 Pleasant Street (Hamel – 14-09P) – CONA (Gutters, Window sill)
70. 39 Russell Street (Walsh – 14-11R) - COA (Addition new wing, repairs existing house)
71. 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa – 14-12M) – COA (Solar Panels)
72. 27 Jason Street (Worden – 14-13J) – CONA (Rear roof)
73. 105 Pleasant Street (Erulkar – 14-14P) – 10 Day COA (Gutters)
74. 105 Pleasant Street (Erulkar – 14-15P) – CONA (Wood trims)
75. 20 Westmoreland Ave. (Housing Corp Arl – 14-16M) – CONA (Roof)
76. 742 Mass. Ave.(Davidson – 14-17J) - CONA
77. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 14-18P) – CONA (Windows)
78. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 14-19P) – CONA (Garage)
79. 81 Westminster (Lemire – 14-21M) – CONA (Roof)
80. 17 Jason Street (Harrington – 14-22J) – CONA (Roof)
81. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 14-23P) – CONA (Front Porch Steps, Landing, Rear Windows)
82. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 14-24P) – 10 Day COA (Gutters)
83. 54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 14-25M) – COA (Addition)
84. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 14-26P) – COA (Siding)
85. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 14-27P) – COA (Front Steps, Garage Renovations)
86. 268 Broadway (Carlton-Gyson – 14-28B) – COA (Fence)
87. 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-29P) – CONA (Front Porch Steps, Fascia, Soffits)

- 88.** 151 Lowell Street (Wyman – 14-30M) – CONA (Wood Trim)
- 89.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-31P) – 10 Day COA (Fiberglass Gutters)
- 90.** 99 Westminster Ave. (Doctrow – 14-32M) – 10 Day COA (Heat Pump)
- 91.** 742 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 14-33J) – CONA (Siding, Corner Boards)
- 92.** 105 Pleasant Street (Malcomson – 14-34P) – CONA (Rear Storm Door)
- 93.** 20 Maple Street (Kapinos – 14-35P) – CONA (Shingles, Rakes)
- 94.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-36P) – CONA (Roof Shingles)
- 95.** 10 Jason Court (Byrnes – 14-37J) – COA (Awning)
- 96.** 15 Montague St. (Lipcon – 14-38M) – COA (WINDOWS AND REAR DOOR)
- 97.** 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 14-39M) – COA (Solar Panel System)
- 98.** 251 Pleasant St. (Fitch – 14-39P – COA (Doors)
- 99.** 7 Oak Knoll (Bailey – 14-40P) – CONA (Roof)
- 100.** 48 Academy St. (Schultz – 14-41P) – CONA (Roof)
- 101.** 17 Russell St. (Makowka – 14-42R) – COA (Wall)
- 102.** 244 Pleasant St. (Preseeman – 14-43P) – CONA (Front Porch and Stairs Rebuild)
- 103.** 16 Montague St (Zona – 14-44M) – CONA (Rear deck)
- 104.** 17 Irving St. (Town of Arl – 14-45P) – CONA (Rear Deck)
- 105.** 174 Westminster Ave. (Szaraz – 14-46M) – CONA (Basement window)
- 106.** 33 Westminster Ave. (Phillis – 14-47M) – CONA (Window Repairs)
- 107.** 154 Westminster Ave. (Walters – 14-48M) – CONA (Front Door, Rear Storm Door)

Meeting Adjourned 10:57pm.